

**GRADUATE EDUCATION COUNCIL MEETING**

Date: Oct 2, 2013

Time: 12:00pm– 1:30pm (*Pizza lunch starting 11:45am*)

Place: Room 147, University Community Centre

---

1. Approval of the Minutes of May 13, 2013
  2. Business arising from the Minutes
  3. SGPS Announcements and Information (Carol Beynon)
  4. Reports from GEC Committees (Peter Simpson, Lorraine Davies)
    - Operations/Agenda and Nominating (Peter Simpson)
      - i. **Recommended that the Graduate Education Council accept and approve the following nominations for the terms stated as members in the GEC**
        1. Faculty Representatives (July 1, 2013-June 30, 2015 -2 year terms)  
Education - J. Brown
        2. Postdoctoral Association at Western representative  
Kalin Penev
        3. Graduate Assistant Representatives (July 1, 2013 -July 2015 -(2 year terms)  
Four names brought forward for three vacancies
          - a. Melanie Caldwell - Theory and Criticism
          - b. Meagan Seale – Ivey Business School
          - c. Cheryl Harding – Physical Therapy
          - d. Julaine Anas Hall – Schulich*Online E-vote results* - Melanie Caldwell, Meagan Seale, Cheryl Harding  
Graduate Assistant Representatives Required
          - a. Arzie Chant – Biology (July 1, 2013 -July 2015 -(2 year terms)
        4. SUPR-G Representatives Required (nominees from the floor)  
<http://www.uwo.ca/univsec/senate/cteeterms/supr-g.pdf>
          - a. 1 Faculty Members (appointed by GEC 2 year term)
            - i. One vacant seat (terms ends June 30, 2014)
  - Policy, Regulations and Graduate Program Membership (attached)
  - Post Doctoral Policy, Regulations and Program Membership Committee (Peter Simpson)
  - Mentorship & Professional Development (Nanda Dimitrov)
    - i. Announcement
4. **Other business**

**A reminder, please sign in on Council Attendance Sheet before leaving the meeting**



# Western Graduate & Postdoctoral Studies

## MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE GRADUATE EDUCATION COUNCIL

May 13, 2013

The meeting was held at 12:00pm in Room 2130, Student Services Building

### Attendees:

Andy Watson	Erika Chamberlain	Lorraine Davies
Benjamin Hill	Glen Tigert	Margaret McGlynn
Carol Beynon	Hesham El Naggar	Mathew VanKoughnett
Carol Jones	Jennifer Hutchison	Pam Bishop
Cathy Nolan	Joanna Blom	Pam McKenzie
Cheryl Harding	June Cotte	Peter Simpson
Christine De Clercy	Katrina Moser	Rick Semmens
Clayon Hamilton	Kevin Godbout	Samuel Trosow
Daniel Vaillancourt	Kristen Hunt	Stella Conostas
Debra Nousek	Linda Miller	Stephanie Dorman

### 1. Approval of the Minutes of May, 2012

The Minutes of the meeting were approved as circulated

### 2. Business arising from the Minutes – none

### 3. SGPS Announcements and Information (Linda Miller)

- Julie Kiser is a new member of SGPS and will be working with Candace, assisting with program reviews
- Starting July 1, 2013 Carol Beynon will be Acting Vice-Provost while Linda Miller is on leave. Linda will spend her study leave researching graduate outcomes.
- Lorraine Davies will be the new Associate Vice-Provost at SGPS
- Peter will be continuing in his role as Associate Vice-Provost.

### 4. Reports from GEC Committees (Carol Beynon, Peter Simpson)

- Operations/Agenda and Nominating (Peter Simpson)
  - i. **Recommended that the Graduate Education Council accept and approve the following nominations for the terms stated as members in the GEC**
    1. **Faculty Representatives** (July 1, 2013-June 30, 2015 -2 year terms)
      - a. Education – J. Brown (replaces P. O’Neil)
      - b. Information and Media Studies – S. Torres (replaces L. Vaughan)
      - c. Health Sciences – S. Scollie (replaces A. Salmoni)
      - d. Arts & Humanities – R. Montano (replaces D. Nousek)

*Approved as presented*

#### 2. **Graduate Chair Representatives** (July 1, 2013-June 30, 2016 - 3 year terms)

*Online E-vote results – J. Dickey, Graduate Chair, Kinesiology, received the most nominations*

*Approved as presented*

#### 3. **Graduate Assistant Representatives** (July 1, 2013 -July 2015 -(2 year terms)

Three vacancies

- a. Julaine Anas Hall, Schulich School of Medicine and Dentistry
- b. Melanie Caldwell, Theory and Criticism, Interdisciplinary – (Social Sciences, Arts & Humanities)
- c. Meagan Seale-PhD Program Coordinator, Ivey Business School

*Suggestion from the floor:*

*Cheryl Harding, Physical Therapy, Faculty of Health Sciences*

Electronic Vote to be held- **Results to be added when complete**

4. **SUPR-G Representatives** Required (nominees from the floor)

<http://www.uwo.ca/univsec/senate/cteeterms/supr-g.pdf>

- a. 2 Graduate Students (appointed by GEC 2 year term)
  - i. Jennifer Hutchison (term ends June 30, 2015)
  - ii. Tamara Hinan (term ends June 30, 2014)
- b. 2 Faculty Members (appointed by GEC 2 year term)
  - i. Benjamin Hill (term ends June 30, 2015)
  - ii. One vacant seat (terms ends June 30, 2014)

*Approved as presented*

- Postdoctoral Policy, Regulations, and Program Membership Committee (Peter Simpson)
  - i. –Length of term

That section 7.6 B1 be amended as presented, effective immediately

*the individual has completed his or her doctoral degree within three years of first appointment;*

revised to

*the individual has completed his or her doctoral degree within five years of first appointment*

**CARRIED**

- Policy, Regulations and Graduate Program Membership  
(all approved changes to policies are effective immediately)

**8.3.1. Format Specifications**

**Integrated-Article**

That section 8.3.1 be amended as presented

**CARRIED**

**8.4.2**

That section 8.4.2 be amended as presented

**CARRIED**

**8.4.2.1 – All examiners:**

That section 8.4.2 be amended as presented

**CARRIED**

**8.4.2.1 Roles of Chair**

That section 8.4.2.1 be amended as presented

**CARRIED**

**8.4.4.1 – Rewording of the preliminary examination of the thesis**

That section 8.4.4.1 be amended as presented

**CARRIED**



**8.4.4.2 – Following the oral examination**

That section 8.4.4.2 be amended as presented

CARRIED

**Regulation 8.4.4.2 re-examination hearing concerning membership of the panel**

That section 8.4.4.2 be amended as presented

CARRIED

**External Examiner's Form**

**See attachment**

That the External Examiner's Form be amended as presented

CARRIED

**For Information: 8.1. Supervisory Committee Regulations**

That section 8.1 be amended as presented

CARRIED

- Mentorship & Professional Development (Debbie Dawson, Nanda Dimitrov)  
No report at this time

**4. Other business**

DRAFT

**Graduate Education Council**  
**Actions from**  
Policy, Regulations & Graduate Program Membership Committee Meetings 2013

---

**MOTIONS TO AMEND GRADUATE REGULATIONS:**

**1. 8.3.1. Format Specifications**

**Integrated-Article** (replace Co-authorship bullet with the following wording)

- In the case of co-authored papers (chapters), the student must include a statement of authorship for each paper included in the thesis, indicating the nature and extent of contributions by others. A clause will be added to the Supervisor Approval Form to confirm the statement(s) of authorship.
- *For information: Ownership and intellectual property issues regarding Integrated-article theses will be kept under advisement for further discussion at a later date*

**2. 8.4.2 – addition of the following words**

**Note:** The thesis defense is normally a closed event unless the student and program by mutual agreement, request that the defense be open to the university community (e.g., faculty, academic colleagues, students).

**3. 8.4.2.1 – All examiners:**

- Normally attend the Public Lecture and Thesis Examination...
- **External Examiner:** attends the Public Lecture and Thesis Examination in person, however participation by videoconference or teleconference is also permitted.

**4. 8.4.2.1 Roles of Chair - if AI is found to be compromised during defense:**

If, at the conclusion of the defence, the candidate's supervisor, the Chair or any member of the examining committee expresses the view that there is a *prima facie* case for alleging

- (a) that a material portion of the thesis has been plagiarized, or
- (b) that there is other evidence of academic misconduct,

the Chair shall withhold his/her signature from the examination certificate and submit the matter (together with any supporting materials) to SGPS for investigation. Where this occurs, the Chair shall, without informing the candidate of the identity of the person making the relevant allegation, inform the candidate that an allegation of academic misconduct has been made. The Chair shall also inform the candidate that an investigation into the matter will be conducted by SGPS, and invite the candidate to contact SGPS to discuss the allegations.

**5. 8.4.4.1 – Rewording of the preliminary examination of the thesis**

- Current wording: *A work that requires only minor revisions may be judged acceptable. Minor revisions include typographical or grammatical errors; errors in calculation, labels for tables, nomenclature, and bibliographic form; and the need for minor clarifications of content. A thesis that requires major revisions in form and or content before it can meet requisite scholarly standards must be judged unacceptable. Major revisions include, for example, faulty conceptualization, inappropriate or faulty use of research methodology, misinterpretation or misuse of data, neglect of relevant material, illogical argument, unfounded conclusions, seriously flawed writing and presentation, and failure to engage*

## Graduate Education Council

### Actions from

#### Policy, Regulations & Graduate Program Membership Committee Meetings 2013

*the scholarly context. The need for the rewriting of substantial portions of the thesis to make it acceptable cannot be construed as "minor." As a rule of thumb, revisions requiring more than two weeks to complete cannot be construed as "minor."*

- **Recommended that wording be changed to:**

There are 2 possible outcomes that the examiners may consider:

1. Acceptable to go to defense with revisions/modifications
2. Unacceptable to go forward to defense

Acceptable with Revisions/Modifications:

A work that requires some revisions/modifications may be judged acceptable.

Revisions/modifications include limited typographical or grammatical errors; errors in calculation, labels for tables, nomenclature, and bibliographic form; and the need for clarification of content.

Unacceptable:

A thesis judged unacceptable may contain for example, faulty conceptualization, inappropriate or faulty use of research methodology, misinterpretation or misuse of data, neglect of relevant material, illogical argument, unfounded conclusions, seriously flawed writing and presentation, and failure to engage the scholarly context.

The completed examiner reports are confidential to the Vice-Provost (Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies). The External Examiner completes the [External Examiner Form](#). SGPS must receive the completed forms from all the Examiners at least five working days before the date scheduled for the candidate's Thesis Examination. **All examiner evaluations are shared with the Supervisor after the examination.**

#### **6. 8.4.4.2 – Following the oral examination**

There are 3 possible outcomes to the oral defense that the examiners may consider:

1. Acceptable - no changes
2. Acceptable with revisions/modifications
3. Unacceptable

Examples of Acceptable with Revisions/Modifications may include limited typographical or grammatical errors; errors in calculation, labels for tables, nomenclature, and bibliographic form; the need for clarification of content in order to meet requisite scholarly standards. Examples may include some additions, deletions or editing of text; further analysis or discussion of some piece of data. Normally, candidates have up to 6 weeks to submit the final thesis after examination.

Unacceptable:

A thesis judged unacceptable may contain for example, faulty conceptualization, inappropriate or faulty use of research methodology, misinterpretation or misuse of data, neglect of relevant material, illogical argument, unfounded conclusions, seriously flawed writing and presentation, and failure to engage the scholarly context.

## Graduate Education Council

### Actions from

Policy, Regulations & Graduate Program Membership Committee Meetings 2013

#### 6. Regulation 8.4.4.2 re-examination hearing concerning membership of the panel

- Current wording: The Re-Examination Hearing Committee is chaired by an Associate Vice-Provost (Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies) and includes the two Program Examiners, University Examiner (the External Examiner's presence is waived), the Supervisor, the Graduate Chair of the program concerned, and two members of SGPS from the candidate's Division but not the program concerned. Note: The candidate does not attend the committee meeting.
- Motion that  
The phrase "two members of SGPS from the candidate's Division but not the program concerned" to be removed

#### 7. External Examiner's Form

See attachment

#### 8. For Information: 8.1. Supervisory Committee Regulations

- Programs are required to establish a formal Thesis Advisory Committee for all thesis-based Masters and PhD students consisting of a supervisor and at least one other person – formatting and wording change to clarify
- Academic Integrity: New process in place that all incoming graduate students must successfully complete the online AI module; effective may 1<sup>st</sup> 2013
  - Turnitin.com – University License covers access by students or faculty for papers or theses

**Graduate Education Council**  
**Actions from**  
Policy, Regulations & Graduate Program Membership Committee Meetings 2013

**EXTERNAL EXAMINER'S REPORT**

Due 7 days prior to the scheduled defense

**A. EXTERNAL EXAMINER RECOMMENDATION:**

\_ The thesis is judged acceptable to go to examination

*(Please use the following as a guideline to provide comments to the candidate that will be provided to the candidate and supervisor after the defense is over. Normally 2 – 3 pages in length is sufficient. In the event this thesis is nominated for an award, the comments below may be included as part of the nomination package.)*

\_ The thesis is judged unacceptable to go forward to examination

*(Please provide specific reasons for this decision. Please note that in order for the thesis not to go forward to defense, the majority of examiners must declare it thus. )*

**B. EXTERNAL EXAMINER'S REPORT**

- I. SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESEARCH QUESTION(S) ADDRESSED/ ACADEMIC QUALITY & MERIT
- II. APPROPRIATENESS OF THE RESEARCH METHODS USED OR THE APPROACH TAKEN; SUCCESS IN USING THE CHOSEN METHOD OR APPROACH
- III. CLARITY OF ANALYSES AND CONCLUSIONS
- IV. ORIGINALITY/VALUE OF THE THESIS AS A CONTRIBUTION TO KNOWLEDGE
- V. STRUCTURE OF THESIS; WRITING OF PROFESSIONAL STANDARD
- VI. QUALITY OF THE WRITING
- VII. OTHER

**PLEASE NOTE THAT THE PRELIMINARY EVALUATIONS ARE CONFIDENTIAL TO SGPS. THEY ARE NOT TO BE SHARED WITH THE SUPERVISOR, CANDIDATE OR PROGRAM**



## SGPS Membership

In accordance with Senate regulations, only members of the School of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies may be involved in graduate student education. For each student writing a thesis, the program must provide a Thesis Supervisory Committee, consisting of a Supervisor, who must have membership in the graduate program of the student, and at least one additional SGPS member who may or may not be in the student's program. For students in professional or course based research programs, supervisors must have SGPS membership in the student's graduate program. In each case, the Graduate Chair for each program nominates individuals for Membership in SGPS.

Three categories of SGPS membership exist: Core Membership, Non-Core Membership and Emeritus membership. Compared to Core Membership, Non-Core membership involves limited educational activities for limited periods of time. Emeritus membership is reserved for retired professors.

**Core Membership** Three types of Core Membership exist: 1. Non-Thesis Membership, 2. Master's Supervisory Membership and 3. Doctoral Supervisory Member.

Core Membership requires an Academic Appointment at Western as Assistant Professor or higher, OR a current Western Adjunct Academic Appointment. For more information about the definition of and procedures for Adjunct Academic Appointments, refer to [http://www.uwo.ca/univsec/pdf/policies\\_procedures/section4/Adjunct.pdf](http://www.uwo.ca/univsec/pdf/policies_procedures/section4/Adjunct.pdf)

Criteria for, and privileges associated with each category are listed below.

**Non-Thesis Membership: Appropriate for limited term appointments, teaching only faculty or adjunct appointments**

### Criteria

- Nomination by a Western graduate program offering an OCGS approved graduate degree
- Ph.D. degree or equivalent qualification appropriate to the discipline
- An appropriate scholarly and/or professional record commensurate with program activities and responsibilities

### Privileges

- Participation as Thesis Supervisory Committee Member
- Participation as a thesis examiner:
  - Chair of a Master's Thesis Examination
  - Program Examiner
  - University Examiner
  - Co-Supervisor of a Master's Thesis (with a Master's Supervisory Member)

**Deleted:** The Graduate Chair for each program nominates individuals for Membership in SGPS.¶

**Deleted: Core Membership¶**  
Core Membership requires an Academic Appointment at Western as Assistant Professor or higher, OR a current Western Adjunct Academic Appointment, for example:¶  
<#>Retired Western Faculty must have a current Adjunct Academic Appointment (Post-retirement) (maximum of 3 years duration).¶  
<#>Individuals who are from off-campus and/or have no other academic appointment at Western (e.g., faculty at Brescia, Huron, or Kings) must have an Adjunct Academic Appointment (Continuous) (maximum of 5 years duration).¶  
<#>Individuals at affiliated research institutes (e.g., Robarts, Lawson, and London Regional Cancer Centre) must have an academic appointment at Western.¶

**Deleted:** <#>Appropriate for new faculty with no experience in graduate education¶

Graduate Course Activities: Includes all teaching activity incorporated under a graduate course number, such as instruction or service as a second reader on research projects (non-thesis), and instructor involvement in practicum courses, internships/co-ops, and field courses

Participation as a reader on a major research paper and/or Ph.D. comprehensive examination

Organizing/conducting/evaluating graduate colloquia, presentations, exhibitions, seminars, field trips/excursions, etc.

Serving as a general or curriculum advisor for a graduate student (general mentoring/program counseling for students re: course selection, career paths)

---

## Master's Supervisory Membership: Normally appropriate for new tenure-track faculty members

### Criteria

(In addition to the criteria for Non-Thesis Membership)

- Nomination by a Western graduate program offering a Quality Assurance Council approved graduate degree with a Master's thesis
- An appropriate track record of peer-reviewed research publications or other evidence of peer-reviewed scholarly productivity appropriate to the discipline
- An established program of research or performance and, where appropriate, research funds from an external source
- A record of successful participation in graduate education (such as teaching a graduate course, serving on a supervisory committee, or thesis examination board)

Deleted: an OCGS

Deleted: Appropriate for new faculty with some experience in graduate education

### Privileges

(Includes all privileges listed under Non-Thesis Membership)

- Supervisor or Joint Supervisor of a Master's Thesis
- Co-Supervisor of a Doctoral Thesis (with a Doctoral Supervisory Member)
- Chair of a Doctoral Thesis Examination (cannot be from the graduate program of the student)

---

## Doctoral Supervisory Membership

## Criteria

(In addition to the criteria for Master's Supervisory Membership and Non-Thesis Membership)

- Nomination by a Western graduate program offering a Quality Assurance Council graduate degree with a Doctoral Thesis
- Satisfactory supervision of at least one Master's candidate (or other appropriate experience in graduate education and research)

Deleted: an OCGS approved

## Privileges

(Includes all privileges for Master's Supervisory Membership and Non-Thesis Membership)

- Supervisor or Joint Supervisor of a Doctoral Thesis

---

## Non-Core Membership: Appropriate for faculty with limited duties or adjunct appointments

Describes individuals providing limited graduate educational activities for limited time periods.

## Limited Membership

### Criteria

- Appropriate scholarly and/or professional record commensurate with the program activities and the nominee's responsibilities and for the period of graduate activity (up to 3 years)

### Privileges

- Participation as Thesis Supervisory Committee Member
- Participation as a thesis examiner:
  - Program Examiner
  - University Examiner

Graduate Course Activities: Includes all teaching activity incorporated under a graduate course number, such as instruction or service as a second reader on research projects (non-thesis), and instructor involvement in practicum courses, internships/co-ops, and field courses

Participation as a reader on a major research paper and/or Ph.D. comprehensive examination

Organizing/conducting/evaluating graduate colloquia, presentations, exhibitions, seminars, field trips/excursions, etc.

---

## Emeritus Membership

All Professors Emeriti who, at the time of their retirement from the University, held either Doctoral or Master's level membership will be automatically granted Emeritus membership upon request. Emeritus membership allows one to chair Master's or Doctoral thesis examinations. This membership is permanent and does not need to be renewed.

Note: Professors Emeriti may also request renewal of their membership at Doctoral, Master's or Non-thesis levels. Regular criteria will apply to such renewals.

### Criteria

- To meet the criteria for Emeritus Membership, a professor, at the time of their retirement from the University, must have held either Doctoral or Master's level membership

### Privileges

- Participation as chair of Master's or Doctoral thesis examinations

### Resources

- Procedures for Adjunct Academic Appointments of Faculty at Western [[PDF File](#)]